## **MINUTES**

The State Board of Elections Board Meeting was held on Monday, November 28, 2011. The meeting was held in the General Assembly Building, Room C, E. 910 Broad Street, Richmond, Virginia. In attendance, representing the State Board of Elections (SBE) was Charles Judd, Chair; Kimberly Bowers, Vice-Chair; Donald Palmer, Secretary; Joshua Lief, Senior Assistant Attorney General and SBE Counsel; and Justin Riemer, Deputy Secretary. Chairman Judd called the meeting to order at 10:00AM.

The first order of business was the approval of minutes from the State Board of Election Board Meetings held on October 18, 2011 and November 8, 2011. After careful review of the Minutes Vice-Chair Bowers noted changes to the minutes. Chairman Judd moved to accept the suggested changes and the Board unanimously approved the revised minutes.

The second order of business was the Secretary's Report delivered by Secretary Palmer. The Secretary's Report is an agenda item for each Board Meeting describing recent developments at SBE. Secretary Palmer reported that SBE received full funding for the Federal Voting Assistance Program grant. Secretary Palmer noted that the grant total of 1.8 million dollars would improve the ability to process ballots to the military and overseas absentee voters. Secretary Palmer noted that this is a result of collaborating with Microsoft & Democracy Live. Secretary Palmer noted that the grant monies would also allow SBE to partner with Open Source Digital Voting Foundation to build a new citizen portal to enable citizens to complete registration and absentee forms via the internet. Secretary Palmer noted that there would also be a partnership with Scytl to research various voting assistance technologies and secure electronic ballot returns. This pilot project would target voters in the Wounded Warriors Program. Secretary Palmer noted that program goals would be achieved if these systems were in place prior to the Presidential Primary. Secretary Palmer introduced David Blackwood, SBE Policy Analyst, as a new addition to the SBE team. Secretary Palmer discussed the recent reports on the Virginia State Budget. Secretary Palmer conveyed that SBE would not be excluded from the overall state budget cuts that are pending and SBE staff had to propose 2%, 4%, and 6% budget reductions. Secretary Palmer noted that they would be targeting the costs associated with paper ballots and mailings and would task technology to perform those functions. Secretary Palmer noted that SBE would try to reduce costs by holding personnel positions open and bring services provided by outside sources inside when lower costs are apparent. Secretary Palmer noted that over the last five years SBE's budget has been cut by more than fifty percent. Secretary Palmer stated that some of the reductions have been passed down to the localities and that SBE was tasked with cutting \$482,000 for the current budget. Secretary Palmer thanked the Board Members for being actively present on Election Day, November 2011. Chairman Judd commented that Election Day was without incident which reflects the quality of the individuals who are working within the election community. Chairman Judd also welcomed David Blackwood to the SBE team. Chairman Judd expressed concern that the SBE budget continues to be reduced, especially with the mandates from the federal government on how to conduct elections. Chairman Judd expressed his gratitude to Secretary Palmer and the SBE staff for pursuing the grant. Secretary Palmer noted that when the federal funds are depleted that the federal mandates will be still be required.

The third order of business was the presentation of the resolution honoring the life and work of Pat Harrington, former General Registrar of Virginia Beach, who passed away on September 30, 2011. Chairman Judd invited the attending representatives of the Harrington family to the podium for the presentation. Vice-Chair Bowers recited the resolution to the family, the attending audience and presented the resolution to Frank Harrington, Pat Harrington's surviving spouse.

The next order of business was to Ascertain the Results of the November 8, 2011 General Election pursuant to § 24.2-534 of the Code of Virginia. Matt Abell, Assistant Manager of Election Services, explained the certification process to the Board and SBE staff members. Chairman Judd stated that comments would be taken after the certification process was complete. Terry Ellen Carter, a Montgomery County voter, approached the podium and requested that the election results in Districts A, D, F, and G in Montgomery County be considered void. Ms. Carter expressed that her requests be validated on the basis that it is unknown how many Montgomery County voters received the wrong ballot on Election Day. Chairman Judd inquired if there was sufficient evidence to withhold certification of the results in the House of Delegates, District 12 and Senate District 21.

Joshua Lief, Senior Assistant Attorney General and SBE Counsel, informed SBE Board Members that if a candidate felt that there was an improper handling of the election process that the candidate should have taken this matter into court. Joshua Lief noted that it is the responsibility of the candidate to bring complaints to the attention of the State Board of Elections. Joshua Lief added that Montgomery County is under censure from the SBE and that on Election Day the problem was identified and quickly resolved. Chairman Judd, Vice-Chair Bowers, Secretary Palmer, Chris Piper, Matt Abell, and Rose Mansfield partnered to complete the certification for the November 8, 2011 General Election. Chairman Judd, Vice-Chair Bowers, and Secretary Palmer concluded the process by signing the Certificates of Election and Chairman Judd declared that the results of the November 8, 2011 and General Election were certified.

The next order of business was Requests for Temporary Full-Time Status for the General Registrars in Surry and Mathews Counties and for the City of Covington. Deputy Riemer informed Board Members that the Electoral Boards have submitted the required requests that are authorized under Chapter 890, 2011 Acts of Assembly Item 80(C). Deputy Riemer noted that these acts authorize the State Board of Elections to approve Temporary Full-Time Status to General Registrars who, because of the size of the locality's population, are only funded to work on a part-time status. Deputy Riemer asked the Board Members approve these submitted requests, with one small modification. Deputy Riemer noted the exception of Surry County request for full-time status through July 31, 2012 which should be modified for full-time status through June 30, 2012. Chairman Judd move that the Board approve the requests from the Electoral Board of Mathews County for funding for the General Registrar for temporary full-time status for the months of February and March of 2012, for the City of Covington for the months of January through May 2012, and for Surry County for the period of January 2, 2012 through June 30, 2012. Vice-Chair Bowers seconded the motion and the Board unanimously approved the motion. Chairman Judd asked if there were any comments and Robin Lind, General Electoral Board Association, offered his support of this approved motion.

The next order of business was the proposed revision to the Virginia Voter Registration Application Form. Jennifer Thomas, SBE Director of Training, explained that with Fairfax County meeting the Voting Rights Act, Section 203 coverage, and in compliance with Virginia Code § 24.2-105, it was necessary to make some minor changes to the Virginia Voter Registration Application Form. s. Thomas explained that the proposed changes included adding an explanation and disclaimer to page one, second paragraph of the Virginia Voter Registration Application Form. Ms. Thomas expressed that additional changes included adding a box, "Check if you need assistance in Spanish" on page 3 and rewording the "Check if you have a disability that requires someone to assist you in order to vote" and deleting the line where a voter describes such disability on that same page. Chairman Judd asked if there were any questions and Vice-Chair Bowers inquired about the location of the changes in section 6. Ms. Thomas directed Vice-Chair Bowers to the print at the bottom of page 3. Joshua Lief, SBE Counsel, noted the proposed change relating to the disability was a positive change and suggested that this change be incorporated into the absentee ballot upon its next revision. Chairman Judd asked if there were any questions or comments from the audience relating to the proposed changes and with there being none Chairman Judd sought a motion to accept the proposed changes to the Virginia Voter Registration Application Form. Vice-Chair Bowers moved to accept the changes to the Virginia Voter Registration Form and Secretary Palmer seconded the motion and the Board unanimously approved the motion.

The next order of business was the complaint by Don Assaid and Mark Tyson against State Board of Elections and Botetourt County General Registrar Phyllis Booze. Chairman Judd asked if there was any member of the audience that would like to address the Board and Mark Tyson, Virginia voter and supporter of Don Assaid, expressed gratitude for the time allowed to address the Board. Mr. Tyson stated that he felt that the State Board of Elections had failed in its charter during this election cycle citing Virginia Code § 24.2-103. Mr. Tyson expressed that he believed that the Board failed Mr. Don Assaid, candidate for Board of Supervisors in the Valley District of Botetourt County. Mr. Tyson expressed that he believed that SBE failed to provide accurate voter status information. Mr. Tyson expressed that Virginia Code § 24.2-504 states that persons are entitled to have their name printed on the ballot as independent candidates and he believes that Don Assaid fulfilled all of those requirements and was denied access to the ballot. Mr. Tyson expressed that the State Board of Elections had failed to respond to all

125 inquiries and pleas for assistance and ignored the problem. Chairman Judd asked Mr. 126 Tyson to detail what he was seeking from the State Board of Elections while the Board 127 was in session on this date. Mr. Tyson stated that he would like some of the problems to 128 be addressed and be corrected so that future elections do not have the same problems. 129 Secretary Palmer addressed Mr. Tyson with the question: "How many members of the 130 SBE staff had he communicated with about this issue?" Mr. Tyson stated that he had 131 talked with Deputy Riemer, Martha Brissette, Andrea Keeles, and Rose Mansfield. Mr. 132 Tyson further stated that, although he had spoken with these SBE staff members, there 133 has yet to be a response. Chairman Judd reemphasized that the responses Mr. Tyson and 134 Mr. Assaid received from SBE staff members are indications that the issues presented 135 were not ignored. Mr. Tyson stated that the Assaid voter petitions were based on of the 136 data presented in the VERIS system on the morning of August 23, 2011. Secretary 137 Palmer informed Mr. Tyson that Botetourt County was complete in the redistricting 138 process on August 17, 2011. Secretary Palmer informed Mr. Tyson that there is 139 supporting documentation regarding the completion of redistricting in Botetourt County. 140 Mr. Tyson asked when the disclaimer was added. Secretary Palmer noted that the 141 disclaimer was added at the request of Don Assaid. Secretary Palmer noted that Don 142 Assaid was the only independent candidate who had any issue getting on the ballot 143 utilizing the SBE process. Mr. Tyson stated that the registrar's office approved Mr. 144 Assaid's petition submissions and the circulator of the petitions as a qualified voter. 145 Secretary Palmer informed Mr. Tyson that he was challenging the State Board of 146 Elections to perform a duty that is not within its power and it is the local General 147 Registrar and Electoral Board's duty to place a candidate on the ballot. Mr. Assaid stated 148 that the General Registrar altered the petitions with White Out and that they have brought 149 this to SBE's attention and it has been ignored. Secretary Palmer assured Mr. Tyson that 150 SBE is not a part of a conspiracy and that SBE did complete redistricting on August 17, 151 2011. Secretary Palmer added that each locality within the Commonwealth has completed 152 redistricting in a timely manner and on schedule. Secretary Palmer noted that there is an 153 investigation into this matter and offered to provide the documentary evidence. Joshua 154 Lief, SBE Counsel, stated to Mr. Tyson that he is welcome to his opinion but to state that 155 the situation was ignored is inaccurate. Mr. Lief further explained that the situation was

looked into at great detail. Mr. Don Assaid approached the Board and stated that, "This is a formal complaint of election tampering and election fraud". Mr. Assaid stated that the General Registrar approved Doug Gimbert, my circulator, as a qualified circulator and a qualified voter on August 23, 2011. Mr. Assaid stated, "She then, very suspiciously, went back and used White Out on the original documents and those documents were altered which is clearly an illegal act". Mr. Assaid stated that "somebody went to the Electoral Board, which we believe was the Republican Committee Chair, and then went to the General Registrar and approved me as a candidate and qualified as a candidate and then it was released to the press". Mr. Assaid stated that over the next two days the local Committee Chair went to them and stated that this could not stand and the General Registrar took a registration form from Mr. Gimbert. Mr. Assaid then stated that he took the minutes from the Electoral Board mass meeting. Mr. Assaid stated that Mr. Gimbert then went to register and he was told by "Suzy Somebody" that he was in the Valley District and that he saw the computer screen showing Mr. Gimbert in the Valley District. Mr. Assaid stated that he asked the General Registrar if they had looked at the other candidates' petitions from two years ago and presented Board Members of the petitions of a rival stating that there were eight signatures added a week after the petition was notarized. Mr. Assaid stated that this is clearly a case of fraud. Mr. Assaid stated that instead of disqualifying the petitions they choose to falsify the document and launch an investigation trying to put my circulator in prison. Mr. Assaid stated that this candidate's personal and corporate attorney is the Chairman of the Electoral Board and the Electoral Board Secretary is his Treasurer. Mr. Assaid asked SBE Board Members to censure the General Registrar and the Electoral Board and turn this matter over to the Attorney General for an investigation for election tampering and election fraud. Secretary Palmer asked Joshua Lief about the assertion of voter fraud and irregularities in this case and the proper place for this to be handled would be in the Commonwealth Attorney's Office. Joshua Leif stated that this assumption was correct and that the local Commonwealth's Attorney would handle these allegations. Mr. Assaid stated that the local Commonwealth Attorney was compromised and that he went to him on this matter and he was told that this was not viable. Joshua Lief inquired of Mr. Assaid if he was referring to Mr. Joel Branscom and Mr. Assaid stated that this was correct. Mr. Assaid stated that Mr.

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

Branscom is compromised in this matter which is why we are asking the Attorney General to investigate this matter. Secretary Palmer stated that he understood that there is an investigation into this matter. Mr. Assaid reputed this stating that the investigation was to see if they could charge Doug Gimbert into falsifying a signed affidavit. Joshua Lief commented that since Mr. Assaid was aware of the investigation then he should also be aware of the names of the individuals conducting this investigation. Mr. Assaid stated that he knew the name of the investigator to be Dick Trodden and that he was meeting with Mr. Trodden tomorrow. Mr. Lief advised Mr. Assaid that he should speak to Mr. Trodden about this matter. Mr. Assaid stated that Mr. Trodden had informed him that this was not the scope of his investigation. Chairman Judd asked counsel to give the Code citation that would support giving the Board the power to conduct the investigation. Mr. Lief stated that under Virginia Code § 24.2-104 this Board could make a request to open an investigation into this matter. Mr. Lief inquired of Mr. Assaid if a lawsuit had been filed. Mr. Assaid stated that they were going to file and then decided to withdraw the lawsuit. Mr. Assaid further explained that he and Mr. Tyson drove to Richmond, SBE, on October 31, 2011, without an appointment. Mr. Assaid stated that he understood that meetings were occurring and they informed Rose Mansfield that they would be unavailable all day. Mr. Lief then asked for a clarification that Mr. Assaid's attorney was Mr. Williams. Mr. Assaid stated that was correct. Secretary Palmer responded by stating that at least five members of the SBE staff discussed this Mr. Assaid and that Mr. Assaid's visit was unannounced and without an appointment while SBE was preparing for an election. Secretary Palmer noted that after Mr. Assaid was informed that there would not be an opportunity to meet on that date that Mr. Assaid stayed in the building. Secretary Palmer informed Mr. Assaid that he contacted Mr. Assaid's lawyer to inform him of the situation and that legal counsel apologized for Mr. Assaid and stated that they were not aware of Mr. Assaid's visit. Mr. Assaid thanked the Board Members for their time.

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

Chairman Judd then asked if there was any other business to come before the Board. Mr. John Roger McCauley, resident of Christiansburg, informed the Board that he had previously spoken previously to past SBE Board Members regarding an investigation regarding the Montgomery County General Registrar's Office. Mr. McCauley expressed

his belief that there is a serious non-performance issue with the General Registrar in Montgomery County and would like this Board to follow the recommendations of previous Boards and send a team into the General Registrar's office to investigate its activities. Chairman Judd stated that Mr. Lief, SBE Counsel, has advised the Board Members on actions required. Chairman Judd stated that the current SBE Board has issued a letter of censure to the Montgomery County Electoral Board and to the General Registrar. Secretary Palmer expressed gratitude to Mr. McCauley for taking an active part in the electoral process and for taking the time to attend local and state meetings. Chairman Judd then asked if there was any other business to come before the Board.

Terry Ellen Carter, a Montgomery County voter, expressed concerns regarding the recent performance of Randy Wertz, Montgomery County General Registrar, in carrying out his assigned duties. Ms. Carter provided several incidents that she said were cause for concern during the recent elections. Ms. Carter stated that as a voter in Virginia she is concerned that the results of the election are distorted due to the mishandling of ballots and the general election laws. Ms. Carter stated that Mr. Wertz and the Montgomery County Electoral Board are incompetent. Secretary Palmer suggested that SBE staff would meet to ascertain the issues and to develop a training protocol. Secretary Palmer stated that he did not see any evidence of fraud or election tampering. Ms. Carter appealed to the Board to vote on additional sanctions. Vice-Chair Bowers stated that we did vote on this issue in the past. Vice-Chair Bowers further stated that the appropriate actions have been taken and have been heard by all current SBE Board Members. Chairman Judd expressed his gratitude to Ms. Carter for taking the time to attend the Board Meeting to share her concerns. Chairman Judd stated that he wanted to thank the gentlemen from Botetourt County and assured them that everything that was said will be taken under advisement and placed in the hands of the proper authorities.

Chairman Judd then asked if there was any business to come before the Board for the Good of the Order. Joshua Lief informed the Board Members that there was a lawsuit in connection with a House of Delegates race, *Osborne vs. Palmer*, and that that the suit has been filed and is in the public record. Mr. Lief stated that the Attorney General's Office was preparing a response and filing the papers today saying that the case is moot. Chairman Judd announced that they would began signing the Certificates of Elections.

249	Chairman Judd then asked if there was any business to come before the Board for
250	the Good of the Order and with there being none Chairman Judd then made a motion to
251	adjourn. Secretary Palmer seconded the motion and the Board unanimously approved the
252	motion. The Board shall reconvene on December 28, 2011 at 10:00AM. Chairman Judd
253	asked for any public comments. There being none, the meeting adjourned at
254	approximately 12:45PM.
255	
256	
257	
258	Secretary
259	
260	
261	
<ul><li>262</li><li>263</li></ul>	Chair
264	
265	
<ul><li>266</li><li>267</li></ul>	
268	Vice-Chair